Article

# Development of sustained release formulations of chlorine dioxide gas for inactivation of foodborne pathogens on produce

Sang-Hyun Park<sup>1</sup>, Sang-Soon Kim<sup>2</sup>, and Dong-Hyun Kang<sup>3</sup>

#### Abstract

Formulations for the sustained release of chlorine dioxide (ClO<sub>2</sub>) gas were developed, and their gas-producing profiles and antimicrobial effects against *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 and *Salmonella* Typhimurium were evaluated in spinach leaves and tomatoes under different relative humidity (RH) conditions. Sodium chlorite (NaClO<sub>2</sub>) and citric acid were used to generate ClO<sub>2</sub> gas, and the generation rate and maximum ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration were controlled using diatomaceous earth (DE) and calcium chloride (CaCl<sub>2</sub>). Under 90% RH conditions, sustained release of ClO<sub>2</sub> gas was achieved in presence of DE. When 12 g of DE was added to the mixture, the ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration remained constant at  $18 \pm 1$  ppmv for approximately 28 h. At 50% RH, addition of CaCl<sub>2</sub> was effective in maintaining a constant ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration. When 0.05 g of CaCl<sub>2</sub> was added to mixtures containing 0.5 g of DE, ClO<sub>2</sub> gas at 90% RH achieved more than 6.16 and 5.48 log reductions of *E. coli* O157:H7 and *S*. Typhimurium on spinach leaves (in 15 min), and more than 6.78 and 6.34 log reductions of the same in tomatoes (in 10 min). The sustained release formulations for ClO<sub>2</sub> gas, developed in this study, could facilitate the use of ClO<sub>2</sub> gas as an antimicrobial agent in the food industry.

#### Keywords

Chlorine dioxide, sustained release, Escherichia coli O157:H7, Salmonella Typhimurium, produce

Date received: 15 July 2020; accepted: 2 November 2020

# INTRODUCTION

Chlorine dioxide (ClO<sub>2</sub>) is emerging as a promising chemical for the decontamination of produce and food contact surfaces (Aieta et al., 1984; Trinetta et al., 2012). It is a strong oxidizing agent and has a broad antimicrobial spectrum. Its efficacy is not greatly affected by either organic matter or pH. The use of aqueous ClO<sub>2</sub> in washing fruits and vegetables and disinfecting meat and poultry has already been approved by the U.S. EPA and U.S. FDA. ClO<sub>2</sub> gas has also been approved for sanitizing environmental surfaces, laboratory equipment, and tools, and for cleaning rooms (U.S. EPA, 2015).

Food Science and Technology International 27(8) 726–733 (© The Author(s) 2021 Article reuse guidelines: sagepub.com/journals-permissions DOI: 10.1177/1082013220976280 journals.sagepub.com/home/fst (\$SAGE Several studies have reported the antimicrobial effect of  $ClO_2$  gas against foodborne pathogens found in spinach (Neal et al., 2012; Park and Kang, 2015), potatoes (Wu and Rioux, 2010), apples (Du et al., 2002), tomatoes (Trinetta et al., 2013), lettuce (Mahmoud and Linton, 2008), cantaloupe (Mahmoud et al., 2008), mung bean sprouts (Prodduk et al., 2014), cabbage (Sy et al., 2005), and strawberries

Corresponding author:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Department of Food Science and Technology, Kongju National University, Chungnam, Republic of Korea

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Department of Food Engineering, Dankook University, Chungnam, Republic of Korea

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Department of Agricultural Biotechnology, Center for Food and Bioconvergence, Research Institute for Agricultural and Life Sciences, Seoul National University, Seoul, Republic of Korea

Dong-Hyun Kang, Department of Agricultural Biotechnology, Seoul National University, Seoul 151-921, South Korea. Email: kang7820@snu.ac.kr

Park et al.

(Han et al., 2004). The antimicrobial effect of  $ClO_2$  gas has also been evaluated against foodborne pathogens on food contact surfaces, including wood, plastic (Han et al., 2003), stainless steel (Trinetta et al., 2012; Vaid et al., 2010), polyvinyl chloride, and glass (Li et al., 2012; Morino et al., 2011).

Although ClO<sub>2</sub> gas has a remarkable antimicrobial effect, along with several advantages over aqueous sanitizers, some factors still limit its widespread application in disinfection facilities (Stubblefield and Newsome, 2015). First, ClO<sub>2</sub> gas needs to be generated at the application site owing to its instability during storage. The gas generation typically requires sophisticated equipment and trained personnel (Stubblefield and Newsome, 2015). Although several on-site ClO<sub>2</sub> gas generation methods, without equipment, have been suggested, they have not been applied in the food industry (Engelhard Corporation, 2001; Fred, 2002; Isaac and Tenney, 2014; Yang and Kim, 2005). Sachets that generate ClO<sub>2</sub> gas are often used to inactivate foodborne pathogens on foods; however, they release too much ClO<sub>2</sub> gas in a short time, and there is no control on the generation rate (Mitchell et al., 2019; Popa et al., 2007; Sy et al., 2005; Wu and Rioux, 2010).

Recently, several studies have focused on the stabilization and sustained release of  $ClO_2$  gas. Chen et al. (2020) have reported an encapsulation method for  $ClO_2$  gas by  $\alpha$ -cyclodextrin, using which, the release rate could be relatively slowed down compared to that by other systems reported in the literature. A polymeric  $ClO_2$  releasing sheet has also been developed using poly (ether-block-amide) and polyvinyl alcohol, which may be applied to prolong post-harvest life of cherry tomatoes (Sadeghi et al., 2020). Zhang et al. (2019) had evaluated the efficacy of  $ClO_2$  microcapsule antibacterial films for the preservation of mangoes.

This study aimed to develop formulations that could ensure consistent release of low-concentration ClO<sub>2</sub> gas, as appropriate for food application. Subsequently, the antimicrobial effects of  $ClO_2$  gas from the formulations were evaluated against Escherichia coli O157:H7 and Salmonella Typhimurium on spinach leaves and tomatoes.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

# Development of formulations for CIO<sub>2</sub> gas generation

Sodium chlorite (NaClO<sub>2</sub>), citric acid, diatomaceous earth (DE) (Samchun Chemical Co. Ltd., Pyeongtaek-si, South Korea), and calcium chloride dihydrate (CaCl<sub>2</sub>) (Junsei chemical Co. Ltd., Tokyo, Japan) were the chemicals used in this study. Table 1 lists the formulations used in this study.

### Release profile of CIO<sub>2</sub> gas from mixtures affected by relative humidity (RH) conditions

ClO<sub>2</sub> gas generation mixtures were thoroughly mixed in Petri dishes  $(90 \times 15 \text{ mm}; \text{ SPL Life Sciences, South})$ Korea) and placed in the treatment chamber (length- $\times$  width  $\times$  height, 0.7 m  $\times$  0.5 m  $\times$  0.6 m). The RH of the treatment chamber was adjusted to  $50 \pm 2\%$  or  $90 \pm 2\%$  using 1 L of saturated aqueous salt solutions. Magnesium nitrate hexahydrate (Mg(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>2</sub>·6H<sub>2</sub>O) (Samchun Chemical Co. Ltd.) and sodium carbonate decahydrate (Na<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub>·10H<sub>2</sub>O) (Junsei Chemical Co. Ltd.) were used to create 50% and 90% RH conditions, respectively. ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration in the treatment chamber was continuously monitored using a ClO<sub>2</sub> gas transmitter (ATi F12, Analytical Technology, U.K.) for up to 36 h at  $22 \pm 1$  °C. The RH and temperature in the treatment chamber were recorded using a thermohygrometer (SE-342, Center Technology Corp., Taiwan).

#### Bacterial cultures and cell suspension

E. coli O157:H7 (ATCC 35150, ATCC 43889, and ATCC 43890) and S. Typhimurium (ATCC 19585, ATCC 43971, and DT 104) were obtained from the bacterial culture collection of the School of Food Science, Seoul National University (Seoul, South Korea). Each strain was cultured individually in 5 mL of tryptic soy broth (TSB; Difco) for 24 h at 37 °C, harvested by centrifugation at  $4000 \times g$  for 20 min at 4°C, and finally washed thrice with buffered peptone water (BPW; Difco). The final pellets were resuspended in BPW, corresponding to approximately  $10^7 - 10^8$ CFU/ml. Mixed culture cocktails containing

**Table 1.** Mixture composition for generating  $CIO_2$  gas at 50and 90% RH.

		Composition (g)			
Mixture No.	RH condition	NaClO <sub>2</sub>	Citric acid	Diatomaceous earth	CaCl <sub>2</sub>
1	50 %	0.25	0.14	_	-
2		0.25	0.14	0.5	-
3		0.25	0.14	0.35	_
4		0.25	0.14	0.5	0.05
5		0.25	0.14	0.35	0.05
6	90 %	0.25	0.14	_	_
7		0.25	0.14	3	_
8		0.25	0.14	6	_
9		0.25	0.14	7.5	_
10		0.25	0.14	9	_
11		0.25	0.14	12	-

approximately equal number of cells of *E. coli* O157: H7 and *S.* Typhimurium were prepared by combining suspended pellets of the two pathogens.

# Sample inoculation

Spinach and tomatoes were purchased from a local market (Seoul, South Korea) on the day of the experiments. Both spinach and tomatoes were washed in running water, placed on aluminum foil in a laminar flow biosafety hood  $(22 \pm 2 \,^{\circ}C)$ , and dried for 1 h before the experiments. Spinach leaves and outer surface of tomatoes were cut into approximately  $5 \times 3$  and  $5 \times 2 \,\text{cm}$  pieces, respectively. A culture cocktail (0.1 ml) was inoculated onto one side of the prepared spinach leaves and tomato surfaces by depositing droplets (with a micropipette) at 15–20 locations. After inoculation, samples were dried in a laminar flow biosafety hood for 1 h at  $22 \pm 2 \,^{\circ}C$  with the fan running.

# CIO<sub>2</sub> gas treatment and bacterial enumeration

ClO<sub>2</sub> gas was generated using mixtures No. 4 and 7 (Table 1) in the treatment chamber under conditions of 50% and 90% RH, respectively. When the desired ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration (10 or 30 ppmv) was achieved, the inoculated samples were placed in the treatment chamber and treated with ClO<sub>2</sub> gas for up to 20 min at 50 or 90% RH and  $22 \pm 1$  °C.

After ClO<sub>2</sub> gas treatment, spinach leaves  $(10 \pm 0.2 \text{ g})$ and one piece of tomato were taken from the treatment chamber and immediately transferred into sterile Stomacher strainer bags (Labplas Inc., Sainte-Julie, Quebec, Canada) containing 90 or 30 ml of neutralizing buffer (Difco), respectively. Stomacher bags were homogenized for 2 min with a Stomacher (easyMIX, AES CHEmunEx, Rennes, France). Aliquots of the homogenized mixture (1 ml) were 10-fold serially diluted with 9 ml of BPW, and 0.1 mL of appropriate diluents were spread-plated onto sorbitol MacConkey agar (Difco) and Xylose Lysine Desoxycholate agar (Difco) for enumeration of E. coli O157:H7 and S. Typhimurium, respectively. In case of low levels of surviving cells, 1 ml of undiluted Stomacher bag contents was equally divided into 0.25 ml portions and distributed between the four plates of each medium and spread-plated. All plates were incubated at 37 °C for 24-48 h, and colonies were counted and calculated as log CFU/g and log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> for spinach leaves and tomatoes, respectively.

# Statistical analysis

All experiments were replicated three times. Data were analyzed by ANOVA suing the Statistical Analysis System (SAS Institute, Cary, NC, USA), and separation of means by Duncan's multiple range test. A value of p < 0.05 was used to indicate significant differences.

# RESULTS

# Release of $CIO_2$ gas from the mixture affected by RH

The ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentrations generated from mixtures at 50% RH are shown in Figure 1. A come-up time of approximately 1.5-2 h was observed for all the tested mixtures at 50% RH. ClO<sub>2</sub> gas generated from a mixture containing NaClO2 and citric acid reached 27 ppmv within approximately 6.5 h and then gradually decreased to 16 ppmv after 36 h. Maximum ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentrations were reduced to 7 and 14 ppmv by the addition of 0.5 and 0.35 g of DE, respectively. ClO2 gas generated from these mixtures slightly decreased to 4 and 11 ppmv, respectively, after 36 h. A more consistent release of ClO<sub>2</sub> gas was achieved by the addition of  $CaCl_2$  to the mixtures.  $ClO_2$  gas generated from a mixture containing 0.5 g of DE and 0.05 g of CaCl<sub>2</sub> reached 11 ppmv and maintained consistency from approximately 9.8 to 36 h. When 0.05 g of CaCl<sub>2</sub> was used in a mixture containing 0.35 g of DE, ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration remained constant at  $16 \pm 1$  ppmv from approximately 12.5 to 36 h. The  $ClO_2$  gas concentrations generated from mixtures at 90% RH are shown in Figure 2. A mixture containing only NaClO<sub>2</sub> and citric acid generated 31 ppmv ClO<sub>2</sub> gas within approximately 3.2 h and the  $ClO_2$  gas concentration rapidly decreased to 2 ppmv after 36 h. The rate of  $ClO_2$  gas generation could be delayed by the addition of DE to this mixture. A mixture containing 7.5 g of DE released  $30 \text{ ppmv ClO}_2$  gas within approximately 15.2 h and the gas concentration gradually decreased to 22 ppmv after 36 h. ClO<sub>2</sub> gas, generated from a mixture containing 9 g of DE, reached 26 ppmv, and remained relatively constant from 13.2 to 36 h. ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration, generated with mixture containing 12 g of DE, reached  $18 \pm$ 1 ppmv and remained constant from 7.8 to 36 h, although maximum ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration dropped to 19 ppmv.

# Inactivation of E. coli O157:H7 and S. Typhimurium on produce by $CIO_2$ gas

Reduction in the number of *E. coli* O157:H7 and *S.* Typhimurium on spinach leaves and tomatoes, during treatment with  $ClO_2$  gas generated from the mixture, is presented in Tables 2 to 4. Treatment with 10 ppmv of  $ClO_2$  gas for 20 min at 50% RH resulted in 1.02 and 1.16 log reductions, and 1.02 and 1.14 log reductions of *E. coli* O157:H7 and *S.* Typhimurium



Figure 1.  $CIO_2$  gas concentration released from mixtures into the treatment chamber at 50% RH for up to 36 h. The test was replicated at least three times.



Figure 2. CIO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration released from mixtures into the treatment chamber at 90% RH for up to 36 h. The test was replicated at least three times.

on spinach leaves (Table 2) and tomatoes, respectively. Exposure to 10 ppmv ClO<sub>2</sub> gas for 20 min at 90% RH caused 3.76 and 3.39 log reductions, and 4.38 and 4.39 log reductions of *E. coli* O157:H7 and *S.* Typhimurium

on spinach leaves and tomatoes, respectively (Table 3). Treatment with 30 ppmv of  $ClO_2$  gas for 15 min at 90% RH achieved more than 6.16 and 5.48 log reductions of *E. coli* O157:H7 and *S.* Typhimurium on spinach leaves

Table 2. Log reductions<sup>a</sup> of E. coli O157:H7 and S. Typhimurium on spinach leaves and tomatoes after treatment with 10 ppmv CIO<sub>2</sub> gas generated by mixtures at 50% RH.

Treatment time	Spinach leaves		Tomatoes	
	Log reduction (log CFU/g)		Log reduction (log CFU/cm <sup>2</sup> )	
	E. coli O157:H7	S. Typhimurium	<i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	S. Typhimurium
5 min 10 min 15 min 20 min	$\begin{array}{c} 0.79 \pm 0.46 \text{A}^{\text{b}} \\ 0.80 \pm 0.58 \text{A} \\ 0.96 \pm 0.36 \text{A} \\ 1.02 \pm 0.45 \text{A} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.87 \pm 0.29 \text{A} \\ 0.98 \pm 0.20 \text{A} \\ 1.00 \pm 0.07 \text{A} \\ 1.16 \pm 0.05 \text{A} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.74 \pm 0.12 \text{A} \\ 0.73 \pm 0.11 \text{A} \\ 0.92 \pm 0.29 \text{A} \\ 1.02 \pm 0.17 \text{A} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.95 \pm 0.08 \text{AB} \\ 0.92 \pm 0.10 \text{A} \\ 1.01 \pm 0.16 \text{AB} \\ 1.14 \pm 0.06 \text{B} \end{array}$

<sup>a</sup>Log reduction = population before treatment - population after treatment. Populations of *E. coli* O157:H7 before treatment were 6.15 log CFU/g and 6.97 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> on spinach and tomatoes, respectively. Populations of S. Typhimurium before treatment were 6.10 log CFU/ g and 6.51 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> on spinach and tomatoes, respectively.

<sup>b</sup>Means with different uppercase letters within a row are significantly different (p < 0.05).

Table 3. Log reductions<sup>a</sup> of E. coli O157:H7 and S. Typhimurium on spinach leaves and tomato after treatment with 10 ppmv CIO<sub>2</sub> gas generated by mixtures at 90% RH.

Treatment time	Spinach leaves		Tomatoes	
	Log reduction (log CFU/g)		Log reduction (log CFU/cm <sup>2</sup> )	
	<i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	S. Typhimurium	<i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	S. Typhimurium
5 min 10 min 15 min 20 min	$\begin{array}{c} 1.74 \pm 0.18 \text{A}^{\text{b}} \\ 2.30 \pm 0.24 \text{AB} \\ 2.72 \pm 0.22 \text{B} \\ 3.76 \pm 0.49 \text{C} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.89 \pm 0.33 \text{A} \\ 2.48 \pm 0.35 \text{B} \\ 2.93 \pm 0.32 \text{BC} \\ 3.39 \pm 0.10 \text{C} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.25 \pm 0.03 \text{A} \\ 1.75 \pm 0.09 \text{B} \\ 3.28 \pm 0.28 \text{C} \\ 4.38 \pm 0.21 \text{D} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.37 \pm 0.18 \text{A} \\ 1.78 \pm 0.06 \text{A} \\ 3.05 \pm 0.25 \text{B} \\ 4.39 \pm 0.36 \text{C} \end{array}$

<sup>a</sup>Log reduction = population before treatment - population after treatment. Populations of *E. coli* O157:H7 before treatment were 6.37 log CFU/g and 7.01 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> on spinach and tomatoes, respectively. Populations of S. Typhimurium before treatment were 6.23 log CFU/ g and 6.66 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> on spinach and tomatoes, respectively.

<sup>b</sup>Means with different uppercase letters within a row are significantly different (p < 0.05).

Table 4. Log reductions <sup>a</sup>	of <i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	and S. Typhimuriui	m on spinach leav	ves and tomatoes a	after treatment with 30
ppmv CIO <sub>2</sub> gas generated	by mixtures at 90	0% RH.			

Treatment time	Spinach leaves		Tomatoes	
	E. coli O157:H7		S. Typhimurium	
	<i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	S. Typhimurium	<i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	S. Typhimurium
1 min	$1.35\pm0.17\text{A}^{\text{b}}$	1.56±0.17A	$1.26\pm0.23\text{A}$	$1.15\pm0.33\text{A}$
5 min	$2.06\pm0.06B$	$1.96\pm0.11A$	$2.52\pm0.36B$	$2.68\pm0.12B$
10 min	$\textbf{4.39} \pm \textbf{0.11C}$	$\textbf{3.54} \pm \textbf{0.59B}$	>6.78 C	>6.34 C
15 min	>6.16 D	>5.48 C	>6.78 C	>6.34 C

<sup>a</sup>Log reduction = population before treatment - population after treatment. Populations of *E. coli* O157:H7 before treatment were 6.08 log CFU/g and 6.68 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> on spinach and tomatoes, respectively. Populations of S. Typhimurium before treatment were 6.45 log CFU/ g and 7.15 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> on spinach and tomatoes, respectively. <sup>b</sup>Means with different uppercase letters within a row are significantly different (p < 0.05).

(Table 4). On the other hand, exposure of tomatoes to 30 ppmv of ClO<sub>2</sub> gas for 10 min at 90% RH caused more than 6.78 and 6.34 log reductions of E. coli O157:H7 and S. Typhimurium, respectively.

# DISCUSSION

 $ClO_2$  gas is commonly generated by the reaction of  $NaClO_2$  with acids or  $FeCl_3$  (both aqueous and dry precursors can be used). Chai et al. (2020) have

evaluated the feasibility and efficacy of using ClO<sub>2</sub> gas, generated by dry precursors (NaClO<sub>2</sub> and FeCl<sub>3</sub>) and dry NaClO<sub>2</sub> and aqueous HCl dosage methods, for the inactivation of pathogens on produce. The results have shown ClO<sub>2</sub> gas generation rate to be more easily controllable when dry precursors are used to produce the gas. Buckley et al. (2020) have produced  $ClO_2$  gas by combining powdered NaClO<sub>2</sub> and citric acid, and quantitatively evaluated ClO<sub>2</sub> production under different temperature conditions. Powdered NaClO2 and citric acid released significantly less ClO<sub>2</sub> gas at low temperatures, and required water to produce the gas. This implied that humidity could affect the quantification of ClO<sub>2</sub> gas production. Similar to the findings from a previous study, RH conditions significantly affected the release of ClO<sub>2</sub> gas from the mixture, in our study. ClO<sub>2</sub> gas was more rapidly generated at 90% RH than that at 50% RH, from mixtures containing only NaClO<sub>2</sub> and citric acid. NaClO<sub>2</sub> and citric acid seemed to easily dissolve and react more rapidly at 90% RH, owing to the greater moisture content in the treatment chamber, and the rapid release of  $ClO_2$ gas. For practical applications, it would be necessary to control the ClO<sub>2</sub> gas generation rate under different RH conditions.

In this study, DE, which is a soft, friable, very finegrained, siliceous sedimentary rock, created by the deposition of fossilized single-cell algae on the ocean and fresh water beds, was used to induce the sustained release of ClO<sub>2</sub> gas (Janićijević et al., 2014). DE presents a highly porous, yet rigid, amorphous silica skeletal framework, whose frustules vary in size, shape, and architecture, depending on a diverse array and species of diatoms (Akhtar et al., 2009; Janićijević et al., 2014). DE has a wide spectrum of applications, such as filters, drug delivery, and removal of heavy metals or pollutants, owing to its low cost, well-defined porosity, and low density (Arik, 2003; Caliskan et al., 2011; Janićijević et al., 2014; Martinovic et al., 2006; Zhang et al., 2011). DE can absorb and gradually release water due to its porous structure, thereby delaying the rapid reaction between NaClO2 and citric acid. DE can also absorb ClO<sub>2</sub> gas and release it slowly thereafter. The use of DE in the generation mixture could hence control the generation rate and the maximum concentration of  $ClO_2$ gas at 90% RH.

In the present study,  $CaCl_2$ , a salt adsorbent, had greater hygroscopic capacity than organic adsorbents, and was used to achieve a more consistent release of  $ClO_2$  gas at low RH conditions (Zhang and Qiu, 2007). At 50% RH, a more consistent  $ClO_2$  gas concentration was maintained due to the addition of both DE and  $CaCl_2$  in the mixture.  $CaCl_2$  seemed to facilitate a more regulated reaction of NaClO<sub>2</sub> with citric acid by absorbing water, under conditions of lower RH. ClO<sub>2</sub> gas, generated from mixtures, had a significant effect on the inactivation of *E. coli* O157:H7 and *S.* Typhimurium on spinach leaves and tomatoes. The levels of reduction of *E. coli* O157:H7 and *S.* Typhimurium, due to the treatment with ClO<sub>2</sub> gas (generated by mixtures) were not significantly (p > 0.05) different from those achieved by a lab-scale ClO<sub>2</sub> gas generation system (Park and Kang, 2015). This implied that mixture-generated ClO<sub>2</sub> gas exerts the same effect in inactivating foodborne pathogens as ClO<sub>2</sub> gas generated by a lab-scale system.

# CONCLUSIONS

Gaseous antimicrobial agents are ideal for commercial antimicrobial applications owing to their rapid spread from the releasing system onto food or food contact surfaces. However, the generation rate of gaseous antimicrobial agents needs to be controlled, in order to represent optimal antimicrobial effects, without adverse impact on food quality. In this study, we developed formulations for the generation and sustained release of ClO<sub>2</sub> gas using NaClO<sub>2</sub>, citric acid, DE, and CaCl<sub>2</sub>. RH conditions affected the ClO<sub>2</sub> gas release profile, and the generation rate and maximum ClO<sub>2</sub> gas concentration could be controlled using DE and CaCl<sub>2</sub>. In addition, ClO<sub>2</sub> gas produced by mixtures showed a significant effect in inactivating E. coli O157:H7 and S. Typhimurium on food or produce surfaces. Although the developed ClO<sub>2</sub> gas-generating mixture could be used for food storage and food transportation, further studies would be required to optimize the packaging conditions of the mixture for practical application.

#### **Declaration of conflicting interests**

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

#### Funding

The author(s) disclosed receipt of the following financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article: This work was supported by the National Research Foundation of Korea (NRF) grant funded by the Korea government (MSIT) (NRF-2020R1F1A1048617). This work was supported by the research grant of the Kongju National University in 2020.

## **ORCID** iDs

Sang-Hyun Park (D) https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2119-7845 Sang-Soon Kim (D) https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7197-2814

## REFERENCES

Aieta EM, Roberts PV and Hernandez M. (1984). Determination of chlorine dioxide, chlorine, and chlorate in water. Journal – American Water Works Association 1: 64–77.

- Akhtar F, Vasiliev PO and Bergström L. (2009). Hierarchically porous ceramics from diatomite powders by pulsed current processing. *Journal of the American Ceramic Society* 92(2): 338–343.
- Arik H. (2003). Synthesis of  $Si_3N_4$  by the carbo-thermal reduction and nitridation of diatomite. *Journal of the European Ceramic Society* 23(12): 2005–2014.
- Buckley D, Annous BA and Vinyard B. (2020). Evaluation of chlorine dioxide gas release rates from dry precursors intended for applied technologies under disparate conditions and their effects on Salmonella enterica, Escherichia coli O157:H7, and Listeria monocytogenes. Innovative Food Science & Emerging Technologies 63(2020): 102307.
- Caliskan N, Kul AR, Alkan S, Sogut EG and Alacabey I. (2011). Adsorption of zinc (II) on diatomite and manganese-oxide-modified diatomite: A kinetic and equilibrium study. *Journal of Hazardous Materials* 193: 27–36.
- Chai H-E, Hwang C-A, Huang L, Wu V CH and Sheen L-Y. (2020). Feasibility and efficacy of using gaseous chlorine dioxide generated by sodium chlorite-acid reaction for decontamination of foodborne pathogens on produce. *Food Control* 108: 106839.
- Chen M, Chen X and Yam K. (2020). Encapsulation complex of chlorine dioxide in α-cyclodextrin: Structure characterization and release property. *Food Control* 107: 106783.
- Du J, Han Y and Linton RH. (2002). Inactivation by chlorine dioxide gas (ClO<sub>2</sub>) gas of *Listeria monocytogenes* spotted onto different apple surfaces. *Food Microbiology* 19(5): 481–490.
- Engelhard Corporation. (2001). Composition for the controlled release of chlorine dioxide gas. US patent 06294108.
- Fred K. (2002). Method of producing chlorine dioxide using a metal chlorite and a water-retaining substance. US Patent 6458735 B1.
- Han Y, Applegate B, Linton RH and Nelson PE. (2003). Decontamination of *Bacillus thuringiensis* spores on selected surfaces by chlorine dioxide gas. *Journal of Environmental Health* 66: 16–21.
- Han Y, Selby TL, Schultze KK, Nelson PE and Linton RH. (2004). Decontamination of strawberries using batch and continuous chlorine dioxide gas treatments. *Journal of Food Protection* 67(11): 2450–2455.
- Isaac TL and Tenney JD. (2014). Mixtures for producing chlorine dioxide gas in enclosures and methods of making the same. US patent 0193522 A1.
- Janićijević J, Krajišnik D, Calija B, Dobričić V, Daković A, Krstić J, et al. (2014). Inorganically modified diatomite as a potential prolonged-release drug carrier. *Materials Science & Engineering. C, Materials for Biological Applications* 42: 412–420.
- Li Y, Zhu N, Jia H, Wu J, Yi Y and Qi J. (2012). Decontamination of *Bacillus subtilis* var. *niger* spores on selected surfaces by chlorine dioxide gas. *Journal of Zhejiang University Science B* 13(4): 254–260.
- Mahmoud BSM and Linton RH. (2008). Inactivation kinetics of inoculated *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 and *Salmonella enterica* on lettuce by chlorine dioxide gas. *Food Microbiology* 25(2): 244–252.

- Mahmoud BSM, Vaidya NA, Corvalan CM and Linton RH. (2008). Inactivation kinetics of inoculated *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Listeria monocytogenes* and *Salmonella poona* on whole cantaloupe by chlorine dioxide gas. *Food Microbiology* 25(7): 857–865.
- Martinovic S, Vlahovic M, Boljanac T and Pavlovic L. (2006). Preparation of filter aids based on diatomites. *International Journal of Mineral Processing* 80(2–4): 255–260.
- Mitchell CM, McGrath A, Beck B, Schurr MJ, Fong D, Leszczynski JK, et al. (2019). Low-cost, small-scale decontamination of laboratory equipment by using chlorine dioxide gas. *Journal of the American Association for Laboratory Animal Science: JAALAS* 58(5): 569–576.
- Morino H, Fukuda T, Miura T and Shibata T. (2011). Effect of low-concentration chlorine dioxide gas against bacteria and viruses on a glass surface in wet environments. *Letters in Applied Microbiology* 53(6): 628–634.
- Neal JA, Marquez-Gonzalez M, Cabrera-Diaz E, Lucia L M, O'Bryan CA, Crandall PG, et al. (2012). Comparison of multiple chemical sanitizers for reducing *Salmonella* and *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 on spinach (*Spinacia oleracea*) leaves. *Food Research International* 45(2): 1123–1128.
- Park SH and Kang DH. (2015). Antimicrobial effect of chlorine dioxide gas against foodborne pathogens under differing conditions of relative humidity. LWT – Food Science and Technology 60(1): 186–191.
- Popa I, Hanson EJ, Todd ECD, Schilder AC and Ryser ET. (2007). Efficacy of chlorine dioxide gas sachets for enhancing the microbiological quality and safety of blueberries. *Journal of Food Protection* 70(9): 2084–2088.
- Prodduk V, Annous BA, Liu L and Yam KL. (2014). Evaluation of chlorine dioxide gas treatment to inactivate Salmonella enterica on mungbean sprouts. Journal of Food Protection 11: 1876–1881.
- Sadeghi K, Kasi G, Ketsuk P, Thanakkasaranee S, Khan SB and Seo J. (2020). A polymeric chlorine dioxide selfreleasing sheet to prolong postharvest life of cherry tomatoes. *Postharvest Biology and Technology* 161: 111040.
- Stubblefield JM and Newsome AL. (2015). Potential biodefense model applications for portable chlorine dioxide gas production. *Health Security* 13(1): 20–28.
- Sy KV, Murray MB, Harrison MD and Beuchat LR. (2005). Evaluation of gaseous chlorine dioxide as a sanitizer for killing Salmonella, Escherichia coli O157:H7, Listeria monocytogenes, yeasts, and molds on fresh and fresh-cut produce. Journal of Food Protection 68(6): 1176–1187.
- Trinetta V, Linton RH and Morgan MT. (2013). The application of high-concentration short-time chlorine dioxide treatment for selected specialty crops including roma tomatoes (*Lycopersicon esculentum*), cantaloupes (*Cucumis melo* ssp. melo var. cantaloupensis) and strawberries (*fragaria* × ananassa). Food Microbiology 34(2): 296–302.
- Trinetta V, Vaid R, Xu Q, Linton RH and Morgan M. (2012). Inactivation of *Listeria monocytogenes* on readyto-eat food processing equipment by chlorine dioxide gas. *Food Control* 26(2): 357–362.

- U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA). (1998). Secondary direct food additives permitted in food for human consumption. 21 CFR. Part 173.300 chlorine dioxide. Available at: www.accessdata.fda.gov/scripts/cdrh/ cfdocs/cfcfr/CFRSearch.cfm?fr = 173.300 (accessed 28 December 2019).
- Vaid R, Linton RH and Morgan MT. (2010). Comparison of inactivation of *Listeria monocytogenes* within a biofilm matrix using chlorine dioxide gas, aqueous chlorine dioxide and sodium hypochlorite treatments. *Food Microbiology* 27(8): 979–984.
- Wu VCH and Rioux A. (2010). A simple instrument-free gaseous chlorine dioxide method for microbial decontamination of potatoes during storage. *Food Microbiology* 27(1): 179–184.

- Yang SH, Kim IO. (2005). Simple apparatus for producing chlorine dioxide gas. US patent 20050224750.
- Zhang B, Huang C, Zhang L, Wang J, Huang X, Zhao Y, et al. (2019). Application of chlorine dioxide microcapsule sustained-release antibacterial films for preservation of mangos. *Journal of Food Science and Technology* 56(3): 1095–1103.
- Zhang XJ and Qiu LM. (2007). Moisture transport and adsorption on silica gel–calcium chloride composite adsorbents. *Energy Convers Manag* 48(1): 320–326.
- Zhang Y, Zhang C, Zhang Y, Zhang G, Liu S and Xu Z. (2011). Development of Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> film on diatomite for treating wastewater containing anionic polyacrylamide. *Chemical Engineering & Technology* 34(12): 2016–2021.